Appendix 16b: Clinical evidence forest plots (psychosocial interventions in opioid detoxification)

Psv	ychosocial interventions	2
,		
	Contingency management	2
	Family interventions	
	Social network interventions	
	Individual drug counselling	

Psychosocial interventions

Contingency management

Review: DMD 8: Detoxification + psychosocial intervention
Comparison: 02 (Detoxification + CM) versus (detoxification + control)

Outcome: 01 Completion of detoxification

Study or sub-category	CM n/N	control n/N	RR (fixed) 95% CI	Weight %	RR (fixed) 95% CI
01 CM					
Bickel 1997: CM+CRA	10/19	4/20	-		2.63 [0.99, 6.98]
Hall 1979: CM	25/40	21/41	-	58.37	1.22 [0.83, 1.79]
Higgins 1984: CM	5/9	2/10	+-	5.33	2.78 [0.71, 10.94]
Higgins 1986: CMmeth	9/13	7/13	- 	19.70	1.29 [0.69, 2.39]
McCaul 1984: CM	7/10	2/10	⊢	5.63	3.50 [0.95, 12.90]
Subtotal (95% CI)	91	94	◆	100.00	1.60 [1.18, 2.16]
Total events: 56 (CM), 36 (cont	trol)				
Test for heterogeneity: Chi ² = 5	6.40 , df = 4 (P = 0.25), I^2 =	= 25.9%			
Test for overall effect: Z = 3.07	(P = 0.002)				
		(0.01 0.1 1	10 100	
			Favours control Fav	ours CM	

Comparison: 02 (Detoxification + CM) versus (detoxification + control)

Outcome: 02 Abstinence: opiate-negative urinalysis or self-report (endpoint)

CM n/N	control n/N	RR (fixed) 95% CI	Weight %	RR (fixed) 95% CI
4/19	2/20		7.78	2.11 [0.43, 10.19]
4/13	4/13		15.97	1.00 [0.32, 3.17]
34/109	18/102	-	74.25	1.77 [1.07, 2.92]
5/10	0/10	 -	_ 2.00	11.00 [0.69, 175.86]
151	145	•	100.00	1.86 [1.20, 2.86]
ol)		•		
,	0%			
, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	0.00			
	n/N 4/19 4/13 34/109 5/10 151	n/N	n/N	n/N

Comparison: 02 (Detoxification + CM) versus (detoxification + control)

Outcome: 03 Abstinence: opiate-negative urinalyses for entire duration of detox

Study or sub-category	CM n/N	control n/N	RR (fixed) 95% CI	Weight %	RR (fixed) 95% CI
01 CM McCaul 1984: CM Subtotal (95% CI) Total events: 5 (CM), 0 (control) Test for heterogeneity: not applicable Test for overall effect: Z = 1.70 (P = 0.0)	5/10 10	0/10 10		100.00	11.00 [0.69, 175.86] 11.00 [0.69, 175.86]
Total (95% CI) Total events: 5 (CM), 0 (control) Test for heterogeneity: not applicable Test for overall effect: Z = 1.70 (P = 0.0)	10	10		100.00	11.00 [0.69, 175.86]
		0.001	0.01 0.1 1 10 100 Favours control Favours CM	1000	

Family interventions

Review: DMD 8: Detoxification + psychosocial intervention

Comparison: 03 (Detoxification + family interventions) versus (detoxifcation + control)
Outcome: 01 Abstinence: opiate-negative urinalysis or self-report (endpoint)

Study or sub-category	family therapy n/N	control n/N				R (fixe 95% C	,		Weight %	RR (fixed) 95% CI
02 Family interventions										
Yandoli 2002: FT	6/41	3/40				+			100.00	1.95 [0.52, 7.27]
Subtotal (95% CI)	41	40							100.00	1.95 [0.52, 7.27]
Total events: 6 (family therap	y), 3 (control)									
Test for heterogeneity: not ap										
Test for overall effect: $Z = 1.0$										
			0.1	0.2	0.5	1	2	5	10	_
				Favour	rs contro	l F	avours	FT		

Comparison: 03 (Detoxification + family interventions) versus (detoxifcation + control)

Outcome: 02 Mortality

Study or sub-category	family therapy n/N	control n/N	RR (fixed) 95% CI	Weight %	RR (fixed) 95% CI
01 Family interventions	0.741	0./40	_	100.00	4 00 10 04 00 001
Yandoli 2002: FT	2/41	0/40		100.00	4.88 [0.24, 98.60]
Subtotal (95% CI) Total events: 2 (family therapy), 0 (cor	,	40		100.00	4.88 [0.24, 98.60]
Test for heterogeneity: not applicable Test for overall effect: $Z = 1.03$ (P = 0.					
Total (95% CI) Total events: 2 (family therapy), 0 (cor Test for heterogeneity: not applicable Test for overall effect: Z = 1.03 (P = 0.00)	,	40		100.00	4.88 [0.24, 98.60]
		C	.01 0.1 1 10	100	
			Favours FT Favours con	trol	

Social network interventions

Review: DMD 8: Detoxification + psychosocial intervention

Comparison: 04 (Detoxification + social network interventions) versus (detoxification + control)

Outcome: 01 Completion of detoxification

Study or sub-category	Psychosocial n/N	Control n/N			(fixed) 5% CI	Weight %	RR (fixed) 95% CI
02 Social network intervention	ons						
Galanter 2004: NT	24/33	26/33			 	100.00	0.92 [0.70, 1.21]
Subtotal (95% CI)	33	33				100.00	0.92 [0.70, 1.21]
Total events: 24 (Psychosoc	ial), 26 (Control)						
Test for heterogeneity: not a							
Test for overall effect: $Z = 0$.	57 (P = 0.57)						
					! ,	_ 	
			0.5	0.7	1 1.	.5 2	
				overre central	Favoure no	aveboooiel	

Favours control Favours psychosocial

Review: DMD 8: Detoxification + psychosocial intervention

Comparison: 04 (Detoxification + social network interventions) versus (detoxification + control)

Outcome: 02 Abstinence: opiate-negative urinalysis or self-report (endpoint)

Study or sub-category	Social network n/N	control n/N			R (fixed) 95% CI		Weight %	RR (fixed) 95% CI
03 Social network intervention	ons							
Galanter 2004: NT	12/33	6/33			+-		100.00	2.00 [0.85, 4.69]
Subtotal (95% CI)	33	33			-		100.00	2.00 [0.85, 4.69]
Total events: 12 (Social netv	vork), 6 (control)							
Test for heterogeneity: not a	pplicable							
Test for overall effect: $Z = 1$.								
			0.2	0.5	1	2	5	
			Fa	avours contr	ol Fav	ours psyc	chosocial	

Individual drug counselling

Review: DMD 8: Detoxification + psychosocial intervention

Comparison: 05 (Detoxification + individual drug counselling) versus (detoxification + control)

Outcome: 01 Completion

Study or sub-category	IDC n/N	control n/N	RR (fixed 95% CI	,	RR (fixed) 95% CI
03 IDC					
Rawson 1983: IDC	4/25	3/25		100.00	1.33 [0.33, 5.36]
Subtotal (95% CI)	25	25		100.00	1.33 [0.33, 5.36]
Total events: 4 (IDC), 3 (contr	ol)				
Test for heterogeneity: not app	plicable				
Test for overall effect: $Z = 0.4$					
		(0.1 0.2 0.5 1	2 5 10	
			Favours control Fa	avours IDC	

Review: DMD 8: Detoxification + psychosocial intervention

Comparison: 05 (Detoxification + individual drug counselling) versus (detoxification + control)

Outcome: 02 Abstinence: opiate-negative urinalysis or self-report (endpoint)

Study or sub-category	IDC n/N	control n/N			t (fixed) 5% CI		Weight %	RR (fixed) 95% CI
04 IDC								
Rawson 1983: IDC	15/25	13/25					- 100.00	1.15 [0.70, 1.89]
Subtotal (95% CI)	25	25					- 100.00	1.15 [0.70, 1.89]
Total events: 15 (IDC), 13 (co	ontrol)							
Test for heterogeneity: not ap	plicable							
Test for overall effect: $Z = 0.5$								
-			0.5	0.7	1	1.5	2	
			Fa	avours contro	l Favou	rs IDC		

Comparison: 05 (Detoxification + individual drug counselling) versus (detoxification + control)

Outcome: 03 Relapse: drug dependent or incarcerated (6-month followup)

Study or sub-category	IDC n/N	control n/N	RR (fixed) 95% CI	Weight %	RR (fixed) 95% CI
01 IDC					
Rawson 1983: IDC	7/25	12/25		100.00	0.58 [0.28, 1.23]
Subtotal (95% CI)	25	25		100.00	0.58 [0.28, 1.23]
Total events: 7 (IDC), 12 (control)					
Test for heterogeneity: not applicable					
Test for overall effect: $Z = 1.41$ (P = 0.16	5)				
Total (95% CI)	25	25		100.00	0.58 [0.28, 1.23]
Total events: 7 (IDC), 12 (control)					
Test for heterogeneity: not applicable	.,				
Test for overall effect: $Z = 1.41$ (P = 0.16)	o)				
		0.2	2 0.5 1 2	5	
			Favours IDC Favours co	ontrol	

Comparison: 05 (Detoxification + individual drug counselling) versus (detoxification + control)

Outcome: 04 Engagement in long-term treatment (endpoint)

Study or sub-category	IDC n/N	control n/N	RR (fixed) 95% CI	Weight %	RR (fixed) 95% CI
01 IDC Rawson 1983: IDC	12/25	4/25		100.00	3.00 [1.12, 8.05]
Subtotal (95% CI) Total events: 12 (IDC), 4 (control) Test for heterogeneity: not applicable Test for overall effect: Z = 2.18 (P = 0.0)	25	25		100.00	3.00 [1.12, 8.05]
Total (95% CI) Total events: 12 (IDC), 4 (control) Test for heterogeneity: not applicable Test for overall effect: Z = 2.18 (P = 0.0	25	25		100.00	3.00 [1.12, 8.05]
		0.1	0.2 0.5 1 2 5	10	
			Favours control Favours IDC		

Comparison: 05 (Detoxification + individual drug counselling) versus (detoxification + control)

Outcome: 05 Engagement in long-term treatment (6-month followup)

Study or sub-category	IDC n/N	control n/N	RR (fixed) 95% CI	Weight %	RR (fixed) 95% CI
01 IDC					
Rawson 1983: IDC	8/25	4/25	- - 	- 100.00	2.00 [0.69, 5.80]
Subtotal (95% CI) Total events: 8 (IDC), 4 (control) Test for heterogeneity: not applicable Test for overall effect: Z = 1.28 (P = 0.2)	25 20)	25		100.00	2.00 [0.69, 5.80]
Total (95% CI) Total events: 8 (IDC), 4 (control) Test for heterogeneity: not applicable Test for overall effect: Z = 1.28 (P = 0.2)	25	25		100.00	2.00 [0.69, 5.80]
		0.	1 0.2 0.5 1 2 5	5 10	
			Favours control Favours IDC		