

APPENDIX 9: METHODOLOGY CHECKLISTS¹

CHAUDHURY2005	2
COULTER2006.....	3
DEVLIN2003	4
DUNCAN2010.....	5
HAMANN2003.....	6
KINNERSLEY2007	7
LEWIN2001	8
MURRAY2005.....	9
NICOLSON2009	10
OCONNOR2009	11
PARRY2008	12
PITKETHLY2008	13
REEVES2008.....	14
SHEPPERD2010.....	15
WETZELS2007	16
ZWARENSTEIN2009.....	17

¹ Further information about each study, including references can be found in Appendix 8.

Study identification	CHAUDHURY2005
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	<i>Chose one option for each question</i>
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Review synthesises evidence in three areas: (1) cost, (2) infection control, (3) therapeutic impact. The third area is the only one that is directly relevant to the review question. Cross-sectional and intervention studies are reviewed narratively.
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	Yes
Study quality is assessed and reported	No
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes

Study identification	COULTER2006
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	<i>Chose one option for each question</i>
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	Yes
Study quality is assessed and reported	Partial
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes

Study identification	DEVLIN2003
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	<i>Chose one option for each question</i>
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes - section headed "Patient-Centred Care" is most relevant
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	No
Study quality is assessed and reported	No
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	No

Study identification	DUNCAN2010
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	<i>Chose one option for each question</i>
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	Yes
Study quality is assessed and reported	Yes
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes

Study identification	HAMANN2003
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Craig Whittington	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	<i>Chose one option for each question</i>
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	No (only Medline and cross-referencing used)
Study quality is assessed and reported	No (no formal assessment is reported, but strength of results is described)
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes

Study identification	KINNERSLEY2007
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	<i>Chose one option for each question</i>
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	Yes
Study quality is assessed and reported	Yes
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes

Study identification	LEWIN2001
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	<i>Chose one option for each question</i>
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	Yes
Study quality is assessed and reported	Yes
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes

Study identification	MURRAY2005
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	<i>Chose one option for each question</i>
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	Yes
Study quality is assessed and reported	Yes
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes

Study identification	NICOLSON2009
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	<i>Chose one option for each question</i>
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	Yes
Study quality is assessed and reported	Yes
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes

Study identification	OCONNOR2009
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	<i>Chose one option for each question</i>
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	Yes
Study quality is assessed and reported	Yes
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes

Study identification	PARRY2008
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	<i>Chose one option for each question</i>
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes – part one of review only (however only one study assesses patient outcomes, the remaining four studies assess clinicians’ performance).
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	Yes
Study quality is assessed and reported	Yes
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes

Study identification	PITKETHLY2008
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	<i>Chose one option for each question</i>
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	Yes
Study quality is assessed and reported	Yes
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes

Study identification	REEVES2008
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	<i>Chose one option for each question</i>
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	Yes
Study quality is assessed and reported	Yes
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes

Study identification	SHEPPERD2010
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	<i>Chose one option for each question</i>
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	Yes
Study quality is assessed and reported	Yes
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes

Study identification	WETZELS2007
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	<i>Chose one option for each question</i>
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	Yes
Study quality is assessed and reported	Yes
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes

Study identification	ZWARENSTEIN2009
Guideline topic: SUE	
Checklist completed by: Melinda Smith	
SCREENING QUESTIONS	
In a well-conducted, relevant systematic review:	<i>Chose one option for each question</i>
The review addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question that is relevant to the guideline review question	No studies were found that included service user experience of care outcomes
The review collects the type of studies you consider relevant to the guideline review question	Yes
The literature search is sufficiently rigorous to identify all the relevant studies	No - EMBASE and PsycINFO not searched
Study quality is assessed and reported	Yes
An adequate description of the methodology used is included, and the methods used are appropriate to the question	Yes