

National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence

215/2 – Percutaneous radiofrequency ablation of renal cancer

Consultation Comments table

IPAC date: Thursday 13th May 2010

Com . no.	Consultee name and organisation	Sec. no.	Comments	Response
1	Consultee 1 NHS Professional	1	there is a need for a RANDOMISED TRIAL COMPARING rfa vs Cryo vs partial nephrectomy	Please respond to all comments Thank you for your comment. Section 1.3 of the guidance will be changed but will not specify trial design.
2	Consultee2 Specialist society NHS Professional	1	These comments are submitted by Dr Patrick Cadigan, RCP Registrar on behalf of the NCRI/RCP/RCR/ACP/JCCO. We are grateful for the opportunity to respond and overall, found the document to be concise and well balanced. We believe that Section 1.3 should go further. We would suggest that further research comparing RFA to other ablative techniques and excisional surgery is required.	Thank you for your comment. Section 1.3 of the guidance will be changed. .

Com . no.	Consultee name and organisation	Sec. no.	Comments	Response
				Please respond to all comments
3	Consultee 1 NHS Professional	2.3	RFA has consistently been shown to preserve renal function more effectively than cryotherapy or partial nephrectomy	Thank you for your comment. Unfortunately the consultee offers no references to the literature or other evidence in support of this statement. From the studies presented in the overview only one (non-randomised comparative) study compares post-procedural serum creatinine levels in patients treated by either RFA or cryotherapy, and indicates no significant difference in this outcome. One other study (a case series) indicates no significant post-procedural deterioration in serum creatinine values in patients treated by RFA. The guidance will not be changed.
4	Consultee 3 Healthcare Other	2.4	Regarding 2.4.8 (adverse events) and mainly bowel perforation, a technique has been in use for a few years which can prevent bowel injuries. It is called hydrodisplacement and can be used to treat renal tumors that are in close proximity to the bowel. Succintely this technique aims at creating a cushion between the bowel and the kidney, displacing the bowel away from the tumor with imaging-guided percutaneously instilled sterile water. It is used commonly in the UK. A paper by Farrell et al describes this technique (Farrell MA et al. Paranephric Water Instillation: A Technique to Prevent Bowel Injury During Percutaneous Renal Radiofrequency Ablation. AJR 2003181:1315–1317)	Thank you for your comment. Reference to hydrodisplacement will be added to the overview and section 2.2.1 of the guidance.
5	Consultee 1 NHS Professional	General	there is a need for Å randomised controlled trials comparing RFA ,cryotherapy and excisional surgery(partial nephrectomy) for the treatment of lesions less than 4 cm	Thank you for your comment. Please see response to comment 1.

"Comments received in the course of consultations carried out by NICE are published in the interests of openness and transparency, and to promote understanding of how recommendations are developed. The comments are published as a record of the submissions that NICE has received, and are not endorsed by NICE, its officers or advisory committees."