

NATIONAL INSTITUTE FOR HEALTH AND CARE EXCELLENCE

Public Health Advisory Committee C – Meeting 3

**Excess winter deaths
8th January 2014**

**NICE London office
Derwent Room
10 Spring Gardens
London SW1A 2BU**

Final Minutes

Attendees:	<p><i>PHAC Members</i> Gina Radford (Chair), Ross Cowan, Barbara Hanratty, Eileen Kaner (from 10.35), Christine Liddell, Jasmine Murphy, Andrew Probert, Simon Roberts, Kamran Siddiqi, David Sloan</p> <p><i>NICE Team</i> Jane Huntley, Hugo Crombie, Victoria Axe, Andrew Hoy, Kim Jeong, Karen Peploe</p> <p><i>Review Team</i> Zaid Chalabi, James Milner, Paul Wilkinson - London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine (LSHTM) Mike Davies – Professor of Building Physics and the Environment (UCL)</p>
Apologies:	<p><i>PHAC Members</i> Raymond Jankowski, John Kolm-Murray, Stephen Morris</p> <p><i>NICE Members</i> Patricia Mountain</p>

Author	VA
File Ref	Draft minutes of PHAC C meeting 080114
Version	Final
Audience	PHAC members, NICE team, members of the public

Item		Action
<p>1,2 Welcome and objectives for the meeting</p>	<p>The Chair welcomed the members of the Public Health Advisory Committee (PHAC), review team & observers to the third meeting on Excess Winter Deaths.</p> <p>The Chair also welcomed the three members of public to the meeting and outlined the protocol for their attendance.</p> <p>The Chair outlined the objectives of the meeting which included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Receiving and discussing the second effectiveness review on excess winter deaths • Hearing developments relating to the existing economic model • Discussing draft recommendations and considerations and discussing additional/amended draft recommendations and considerations <p>The Chair informed the PHAC that apologies had been received. These are noted above.</p> <p>The Chair informed the committee that recently there have been enquiries on this topic from the press. Members of the committee were reminded that they should not talk to the press about any aspect of the development of the guidance. If members of the public are contacted by external organisations they should inform the press department by contacting alice.law@nice.org.uk.</p> <p>Action: NICE to circulate Alice Law’s contact details to the committee</p>	<p>NICE Team</p>
<p>3. Declarations of Interests</p>	<p>The Chair explained that verbal declarations of interest are a standing item on every agenda and are recorded in the minutes as a matter of public record.</p> <p>The members of the committee, NICE staff and the review team were asked for further declarations of interest.</p> <p>Karen Peplow declared that her husband, Stefano Boggia, is a landlord by occupation (as a sole trader) and rents some residential properties in both the private and social housing sector. One of these is owned by Karen and some are jointly owned. Karen’s husband also owns and is director of a property maintenance company (di Stefano Property Maintenance Limited). Karen is the registered secretary of this company.</p>	

	<p>There were no further conflicts of interest</p> <p>The Chair and the Associate Director noted that the interests previously declared did not prevent the attendees at committee from fully participating in the meeting.</p>	
4. Minutes of the last meeting	<p>Two minor changes to the draft minutes were suggested.</p> <p>The minutes were accepted as an accurate record of the meeting and it was confirmed that all actions had been addressed.</p>	
5. Possible expert testimony	<p>NICE presented a draft list of possible areas where known experts could be approached to give testimony at a later meeting. The committee discussed and prioritised these and a number of possible future experts were suggested.</p> <p>Action: The NICE team to produce a short list for discussion with the Chair and contact the suggested experts.</p>	NICE Team
6. Presentation of effectiveness review 2	<p>Paul Wilkinson (PW) gave a presentation on the second effectiveness review on excess winter deaths.</p> <p>The Chair reminded the committee that this review related to mortality as well as morbidity.</p>	
7. NICE comments on review 2	<p>NICE noted that the team had made some small amendments to the review in order to improve readability which included: spell checking; the insertion of section numberings; formatting of section names; and the occasional clarification of section names, headings and evidence statements. The specific wording within the review had not been altered. It was also noted that due to the lack of time between submission and mail out to the committee, the NICE team had not been able to quality assure the review prior to the committee viewing it.</p> <p>Hugo Crombie (HC) briefly outlined the amendments that had been carried out and informed the committee that a revised review will be emailed to the PHAC for sign off, prior to consultation.</p> <p>The PHAC made some suggestions for further amendments to the review.</p>	
8. Questions and Discussions	<p>The PHAC asked LSHTM a number of questions in regard to their review.</p> <p>There were discussions around the following:</p>	

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Social behaviour and physical activity • Worklessness • Loneliness and isolation • Mental health • Public behaviours in colder climates and how colder weather countries deal with harsh conditions • Damp and condensation in households increasing due to fuel poverty, and ways this can be tackled 	
9. Presentation of economics review	Paul Wilkinson gave a presentation on the economics summary.	
10. Update on the health economics modelling <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Subgroup discussions • Preliminary discussions 	<p>Kim Jeong (KJ) gave an update on the economics subgroup discussions. These included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Individual costs e.g. illness, loss of earning, cost of heating • Health sector costs e.g. treating illness, primary care visits, in patient care • Local Authority costs e.g. social care, social care visits • Community costs • Society costs – CO2 emissions, air pollution • Education <p>The next subgroup discussion will be held on the 15th January 2014.</p> <p>James Milner gave a presentation on the preliminary outcomes from modelling to date.</p>	
11. Questions and discussion	<p>The PHAC were invited to ask the presenters questions in regard to the economics model.</p> <p>A number of areas were discussed including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Improving heating systems • Insulation techniques, legal processes and evidence for indoor pollution and effects on ventilation • The relationship between internal temperature and health impacts • Utility weight calculations against cardiovascular illnesses • The health benefits of using these interventions in targeting specific populations with health difficulties • CO2 emissions <p>The PHAC suggested some amendments to the</p>	

	current model.	
12. Existing considerations and recommendations	The NICE team presented some draft considerations and recommendations based on committee discussions to date.	
13. Discussion of considerations and recommendations	<p>The PHAC were encouraged to discuss and amend these draft considerations.</p> <p>It was agreed that the PHAC would need to consider further evidence before drafting recommendations on targeting subgroups.</p> <p>There was a discussion around the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • targeting of patients • the efficacy of vaccination programmes • discharge planning services • health education and training <p>It was requested that targeting, immunisation and uptake should be added to review 3.</p> <p>The NICE team reassured the committee that there would be no duplication between this guidance and previous guidance from either the Centre of Public Health or any other department.</p> <p>Action: The NICE team to encourage Macmillan Cancer Support to register as a stakeholder</p>	NICE Team
14. Drafting of recommendations	<p>The PHAC were asked to begin thinking about drafting recommendations using the evidence they had heard today.</p> <p>A number of areas for recommendations were suggested including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ventilation • health forecasting • thermal clothing and impact on core temperature • mental health • musculoskeletal effects • the provision of non slip footwear • encouraging and maintaining physical activity • coping advice strategies <p>Action: The NICE team to draft a table of possible interventions, targets and actors.</p> <p>Action: PHAC members to email HC with any suggested recommendations</p>	<p>NICE Team</p> <p>NICE Team</p>

	Action: The NICE team to expand the draft recommendations and work further on the logic model.	NICE Team
15. Any other business	<p>HC informed the group that British Gas had approached NICE in regard to a programme they are running in conjunction with Barts NHS Trust entitled Living Well, Living Warm. It was noted that some information from this programme may be available prior to publication of the Excess Winter Deaths guidance. It was also noted that a number of other energy providers are involved in similar programmes.</p> <p>Action: The NICE Team to arrange meetings with organisations from the energy provider</p>	NICE Team
Close	The meeting closed at 3.25pm	