

Physical Activity and the Environment Update

Consultation on draft scope Stakeholder comments table

24/03/16 to 22/04/16

ID	Type	Organisation name	Page no.	Line no.	Comments Please insert each new comment in a new row	Developer's response Please respond to each comment
1	SH	Department of Health	General	General	I wish to confirm that the Department of Health has no substantive comments to make, regarding this consultation.	Thank you for responding to the consultation on this draft scope and for confirming this.
2	SH	Insall & Coe	General		<p>Wherever reference is made to effectiveness, cost effectiveness, economic aspects etc (and quite rightly, these are stitched throughout the draft scope) it is important to take into account the wide range of co-benefits generated by some forms of intervention or approaches to promote physical activity.</p> <p>For example, many strategies, programmes and schemes which promote active travel are known also to generate economic value through climate emissions reduction, air quality improvement, road danger reduction, noise and so on.</p> <p>In the case of certain other approaches to physical activity promotion, there may be fewer or no co-benefits.</p> <p>It is not easy to calculate the totality of benefits across all these sectors but some effort needs to be made – it would be quite wrong to undervalue work of this kind by comparing it with other approaches to the promotion of PA on the economic value of fitness gains alone.</p>	Thank you for your comments on this draft scope. We have clarified in the scope that the economic analysis will cover both health and non-health benefits. Regarding your specific point about co-benefits, we are keen to capture all relevant benefits. However, it is likely to be beyond the resources and timescale of the project to capture everything in a de novo economic model. Moreover, based on previous analyses we believe there will be a paucity of relevant data to populate such a model. That said, we will endeavour to document the benefits even if they can't all be quantified.
3	SH	Insall & Coe	6	155 - 173	The forthcoming Air Quality guidance should naturally link to this one, via elements relating to active travel.	Noted, thank you. When complete, both guidelines will be included in NICE pathways and linked where appropriate.
4	SH	National Obesity Forum		55	The interiors of public buildings such as hotels, shopping centres and public offices, libraries etc are important aspects of the health related built environment, and are susceptible to challenge from planning authorities in order to improve health status.	<p>Thank you for your comments on this draft scope.</p> <p>Although building design factors will not be reviewed by this update, the existing recommendations relating to this topic remain valid and will be incorporated in the updated</p>

ID	Type	Organisation name	Page no.	Line no.	Comments Please insert each new comment in a new row	Developer's response Please respond to each comment guideline.
5	SH	National Obesity Forum		56	The equality impact statement suggests that school playgrounds are only useful for schoolchildren during school hours, which rather defeats the object of this guideline, which could recommend that school playgrounds could open outside school hours, and serve a wider community.	<p>Thank you for this comment. NICE guideline PH17 makes an existing recommendation in this area (Please see below)</p> <p><i>'Make school facilities available to children and young people before, during and after the school day, at weekends and during school holidays. These facilities should also be available to public, voluntary, community and private sector groups and organisations offering physical activity programmes and opportunities for physically active play'.</i></p> <p>The Equality Impact Assessment notes that the recommendation in PH8 is still valid and that this issue may be better addressed by another guideline.</p>
6	SH	National Obesity Forum		95-96	The National Obesity Forum broadly supports the draft, and agrees that increased physical activity in the built and natural environments is essential to health. However we believe that there are two stances in the document that are mutually exclusive. The equality impact statement states that priority is given to those with limited mobility, disabled or in wheelchairs, whereas lines 95-96 state that "Interventions to increase physical activity as part of managing chronic or other conditions" will not be covered. However a wheelchair user is a specific individual with a chronic condition who is being considered by the equality impact statement, therefore how can other chronic conditions be excluded? Obesity and overweight are chronic conditions which affect around two-thirds of the population, and cause disability and immobility, but are not referred to in the draft, which is potentially discriminating against overweight and obese individuals. The guidance must not restrict its remit to the minority of the population who are lean, as the anomalies of the built environment are a significant causative factor in the obesity epidemic. Obesity is not mentioned in the draft, yet fits the definition given in the equality impact statement as a condition which causes restricted mobility.	<p>Thank you for this comment. The guideline covers the whole population but will give particular consideration to groups with limited mobility to extend the original guideline. Improving access will focus on those for whom mobility is reduced, for whatever reason. However, the guideline does not address the individual management of chronic conditions as this is under the remit of other guidelines. For obesity, this includes among others CG189, PH27, PH42, PH47, PH53</p>

Comments received in the course of consultations carried out by NICE are published in the interests of openness and transparency, and to promote understanding of how recommendations are developed. The comments are published as a record of the submissions that NICE has received, and are not endorsed by NICE, its officers or advisory committees.

ID	Type	Organisation name	Page no.	Line no.	Comments Please insert each new comment in a new row	Developer's response Please respond to each comment and NG7.
7	SH	Natural Resources Wales	3	65-70	<p>We believe that within the section for local strategies, policies and plans, there should be a bullet noting that consideration should be paid to ensuring that good quality GI be considered (e.g. greenspace, tree canopy cover, green corridors, community gardens, roadsides, etc.) and are made available in communities to encourage physical activity.</p> <p>A Faculty of Public Health publication in association with Natural England: 'Great Outdoors: How Our Natural Health Service Uses Green Space To Improve Wellbeing' gives a recent summary of the effects of natural environments on wellbeing and demonstrates the vital role it can play in promoting better wellbeing and preventing health problems. The paper states: 'A wide range of evidence suggests that contact with safe, green spaces can improve a number of aspects of mental and physical health and wellbeing as well as various social and environmental indicators. For example:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Contact with green spaces and natural environments can reduce symptoms of poor mental health and stress, and can improve mental wellbeing across all age groups. • Access to green spaces can increase levels of physical activity for all ages. • Having green spaces in an area can contribute to reduced health inequalities. • Safe, green spaces can increase levels of communal activity across different social groups as well as increase residents' satisfaction with their local area. • Green spaces can help with our response to climate change through their potential to reduce the impacts of heatwaves and reduce flooding and reducing CO2 emissions. • Green spaces and natural environments can improve air and noise quality and support sustainability through increasing biodiversity, encouraging active transport and community participation.' 	<p>Thank you for your comments on this draft scope.</p> <p>'Changes to the infrastructure for both green and blue spaces' have been added to the scope. Terms such as 'green infrastructure', 'green space' and 'blue space' may be added to the search strategy to identify relevant interventions.</p>
8	SH	Natural Resources Wales	3	71-78	<p>Again, we would like to see a bullet within this section that refers to ensuring that GI is considered in transport planning.</p> <p>Evidence shows that establishing 'greener' streets provides a more desirable environment for active travel and everyday activity.</p> <p>Street trees not only look great but perform multiple services. They act as carbon sinks and air filters and reduce pollution, soak up excess water and reduce the urban heat island effect, and also provide oxygen. For example, an 80-foot beech tree has been shown to absorb the daily carbon dioxide output of two family homes. Having better air quality is again more likely to encourage people to use the outdoors for active recreation and active travel.</p> <p>'Tree in Hard Landscapes – A Guide for Delivery' produced by the Trees and Design Action Group highlights how urban trees can make a significant contribution to a sustainable, integrated infrastructure approach, promoting value and economic development, climate change adaptation</p>	Please see above

Comments received in the course of consultations carried out by NICE are published in the interests of openness and transparency, and to promote understanding of how recommendations are developed. The comments are published as a record of the submissions that NICE has received, and are not endorsed by NICE, its officers or advisory committees.

ID	Type	Organisation name	Page no.	Line no.	Comments Please insert each new comment in a new row	Developer's response Please respond to each comment
					<p>and human health and wellbeing. The paper provides practical strategies to ensure how trees best contribute to the delivery of the design objectives of a project.</p> <p>Sustainable drainage systems or (SuDs) can be designed or retrofitted within streets and urban green spaces to better cope with predicted extreme weather events and also make the street environment greener and more desirable to attract active travel.</p> <p>Extensive green networks or connected 'urban ecosystems' can support active travel, help rebuild biodiversity and provide substantial climate change adaptation such as natural drainage solutions and better airflows. Green spaces are far more effective when linked as they allow people and wildlife to travel through urban areas.</p>	
9	SH	Natural Resources Wales		175	<p>The facts and figures within this section relate to physical activity in general. We think it would be advantageous to include more detail around the environment.</p> <p>Research by the Landscape Institute has established that there are clear links between good-quality landscapes and health and wellbeing. There is an increasingly strong evidence base to demonstrate the positive effects that access to good-quality landscapes has on our health and wellbeing – and the negative effects when we don't. We also know that areas of social and economic deprivation, which are often linked with poorer health and reduced life expectancy, can be associated with limited access to good-quality green space (Landscape and Public Health: Creating Healthy Places. Landscape Institute, Nov 2013). Data from NRW supports this. Using data collected for NRW's Good for People Toolkit and overlaying NRW's LANDMAP landscape assessment evidence, we have established that there are 2.6 times more communities suffering ill health in poor quality landscapes than there are reporting ill health in the highest quality landscapes (NRW, 2015).</p> <p>Evidence shows that walking in a natural green space has more benefits to your health than walking on a treadmill or in urban environments. Evidence shows that taking a walking break in a nearby park rather than walking the pavements decreases anxiety and increases working memory performance – a walk in the park helps mood and helps get away from negative thoughts as well being good for physical health.</p>	<p>Noted, thank you. As above, we have included 'changes to the infrastructure for both green and blue spaces' in the scope. While we acknowledge the importance of other outcome measures relating to mental health for example, the primary focus of this particular guideline is on outcomes relating to physical activity.</p>
10	SH	Public Health England	1.3	69-70	<p>accessibility of local facilities and services on foot, by bicycle and public transport - There is a correlation between public transport usage and physical activity, e.g. http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC3407915/pdf/ijerph-09-02454.pdf</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments on this draft scope.</p> <p>Section 3.2 of the revised scope notes that using public transport may enable people to build more</p>

Comments received in the course of consultations carried out by NICE are published in the interests of openness and transparency, and to promote understanding of how recommendations are developed. The comments are published as a record of the submissions that NICE has received, and are not endorsed by NICE, its officers or advisory committees.

ID	Type	Organisation name	Page no.	Line no.	Comments	Developer's response
					Please insert each new comment in a new row	Please respond to each comment
						physical activity into their daily lives.
11	SH	Public Health England	1.3	79	mixed mode travel - See above comment	Please see above.
12	SH	Public Health England	1.3	91-92	enable people with physical, sensory and learning impairments impacting on their mobility - There are barriers for people with disabilities beyond physical, e.g. http://www.efds.co.uk/assets/0000/3833/Understanding_the_barriers_to_participation_20120510.pdf	Noted, thank you. We have amended this in the revised scope.
13	SH	Public Health England	3.1	184-191	Being active in childhood helps maintain a healthy weight, enhances bone and cardio-metabolic health, improves mental health, develops social skills and confidence, and improves learning and academic achievement (Rapid evidence review on the effect of physical activity participation among children aged 5 – 11 years Chalkley et al 2015).	Noted, thank you. We have amended this in the revised scope.
14	SH	Public Health England	3.1	192-200	Based on cases of coronary heart disease, stroke, diabetes, colorectal cancer and breast cancer, inactivity costs the NHS in the UK an estimated £0.9 billion per year. These costs are likely to be higher if falls, hypertension and other health problems potentially linked to physical activity (The economic burden of ill health due to diet, physical inactivity, smoking, alcohol and obesity in the UK , Scarborough et al. 2011) are considered. It also doesn't consider the wider £6.5 billion cost to UK society (The economic burden of physical inactivity in England. Ossa D and Hutton J 2002).	Noted, thank you. We have amended this section in the revised scope.
15	SH	Public Health England	3.2	203	These state that adults (aged 19 and over)	Noted, thank you. We have amended this in the revised scope.
16	SH	Public Health England	3.2	207-209	Adults should also do muscle strengthening on at least two days each week and minimise the amount of time spent sedentary (sitting) for extended periods.	Noted, thank you. We have included this in the revised scope
17	SH	Public Health England	3.2	214-217	Children and young people should do activities that strengthen muscles and bone at least three days a week and minimise the amount of time spent sedentary (sitting) for extended periods.	Noted, thank you. We have amended this section in the revised scope
18	SH	Public Health England	3.2	218-221	In the early years (under five years), children should be physically active daily for at least 180 minutes spread throughout the day and minimise the amount of time spent sedentary (sitting) for extended periods (except time spent sleeping).	Noted, thank you. We have amended this section this in the revised scope
19	SH	Public Health England	3.3	240-244	The NHS Five Year Forward View focus on prevention highlights the lack of physical activity across the population. There is a National ambition for an annual increase in numbers of adults achieving the physical activity guidelines and decrease in those doing less than 30 minutes per week (Moving More, Living More HMG 2014).	Noted, thank you. We have included this in the revised scope
20	SH	Royal	General	General	Please consider green exercises including gardening and dancing within the scope:	Thank you for your comments on

Comments received in the course of consultations carried out by NICE are published in the interests of openness and transparency, and to promote understanding of how recommendations are developed. The comments are published as a record of the submissions that NICE has received, and are not endorsed by NICE, its officers or advisory committees.

ID	Type	Organisation name	Page no.	Line no.	Comments Please insert each new comment in a new row	Developer's response Please respond to each comment
		College of General Practitioners			<p><u>Green exercise</u></p> <p>Countryside Recreation Network. (2006) A Countryside for Health and Wellbeing: The Physical and Mental Health Benefits of Green Exercise [Online]. Available from: http://www.thehealthwell.info/node/3900</p> <p>This report reviewed existing green exercise studies in the UK on the effects of the view from the window (University of Essex), on Walking for Health Initiatives, and Green Gyms (conservation activities for health). It also undertook research on the effects of active participation in the countryside. To do this, it conducted a quantitative analysis of the effects of ten countryside activities in England, Scotland, Northern Ireland and Wales on the health of 263 people.</p> <p>The authors report there is substantial evidence that links the natural environment with good physical health and psychological well-being. Green exercise is physical activity taken outside while exposed to nature. As both physical activity and nature can positively affect wellbeing, this research was undertaken to explore the synergy in adopting physical activities whilst being directly exposed to nature. The evidence indicates that nature can make positive contributions to our health, help us recover from pre-existing stresses or problems, have an immunizing effect by protecting us from future stresses, and help us to concentrate and think more clearly. We have discerned three levels of engagement with nature i. viewing nature as through a window, or in a painting; ii. being in the presence of nearby nature which may be incidental to some other activity, such as walking or cycling to work, reading on a garden seat or talking to friends in a park; and iii. active participation and involvement with nature 3 such as gardening, farming, trekking, camping, cross-country running or horse-riding.”</p> <p><u>Dancing</u> The Effectiveness of Dance Interventions to Improve Older Adults' Health: A Systematic Literature Review Hwang, Phoebe Woei-Ni, MS; Braun, Kathryn L, Alternative Therapies in Health and Medicine 21.5 (Sep/Oct 2015): 64-70.</p> <p>Their findings suggest that dance, regardless of its style, can significantly improve muscular strength and endurance, balance, and other aspects of functional fitness in older adults. (MH)</p>	<p>this draft scope.</p> <p>The focus of this particular guideline is on the impact of interventions in the built or natural environment that may encourage and support physical activity rather than interventions to increase activities undertaken by individuals within these spaces. These are covered by other NICE guidelines such as NG7 Preventing excess weight gain for example.</p>
21	SH	Royal College of Nursing	General	General	This is to inform you that the Royal College of Nursing have no comments to submit to inform on the above draft scope at this present time.	Thank you for responding to the consultation on this draft scope and for confirming this.

Comments received in the course of consultations carried out by NICE are published in the interests of openness and transparency, and to promote understanding of how recommendations are developed. The comments are published as a record of the submissions that NICE has received, and are not endorsed by NICE, its officers or advisory committees.

ID	Type	Organisation name	Page no.	Line no.	Comments Please insert each new comment in a new row	Developer's response Please respond to each comment
22	SH	Scottish Natural Heritage	General		The document does not provide a description of the term 'natural environment', the consequence of which is the omission of opportunities to encourage physical activity in areas beyond a limited list of types of 'open space'. Paths networks through urban, urban-fringe and more rural areas provide opportunities for active travel and recreational physical activity. This comment is backed up by the extensive description of 'blue space' cited in Line 150, which is not (but should be) matched by a similarly extensive description of 'green space'.	Noted thank you. in the revised scope we have included further examples of different types of green spaces, but due to space it does not provide an exhaustive list. This term is likely to be defined within the glossary of the final guideline.
23	SH	Scottish Natural Heritage	1	23	Suggest the addition of 'countryside management and public access' in the list of those for whom the Guideline is for	Thank you for this comment, we consider that this is covered by 'others responsible for open spaces'. The final guideline may include more detail on who the guideline is specifically for, based on the recommendations made.
24	SH	Scottish Natural Heritage	1	25	The list of examples of Others responsible for open space is too limited, and implies a narrow and largely municipal scope of 'open space'. Suggest this paragraph is revised to include – other local greenspace and amenity areas	Thank you for this comment. The list includes examples and is not intended to be exhaustive.
25	SH	Scottish Natural Heritage	2	28	This paragraph should be preceded by a new bullet point which would refer to the relevance of this Guideline to those responsible for the planning and management of path networks providing connectivity between open spaces and public access to the natural environment	Thank you for this comment. We consider that this issue is covered across the bullets under 'who the guideline is for' and is also included within the areas to be updated in section 1.3
26	SH	Scottish Natural Heritage	2	43	In considering the factors that reduce people's ability to be physically active, it is suggested that those with 'other additional needs' include women – in their role as primary child-carers and the need to gain access with buggies or bikes; and in the context of women citing 'not feeling safe' as a barrier to them taking access to open spaces / path networks / countryside. These gender-related issues should also be picked up in the Equality Impact Assessment	Thank you for this comment. The scope includes all population groups. The scope as it stands does not preclude consideration of reduced mobility due to a buggy or pram. Specific interventions to increase activities within spaces (e.g. guided walks and use of green gyms) are outside the remit of the scope. The outcome measures included in the scope are examples only and not an exhaustive list; all

Comments received in the course of consultations carried out by NICE are published in the interests of openness and transparency, and to promote understanding of how recommendations are developed. The comments are published as a record of the submissions that NICE has received, and are not endorsed by NICE, its officers or advisory committees.

ID	Type	Organisation name	Page no.	Line no.	Comments Please insert each new comment in a new row	Developer's response Please respond to each comment
						relevant outcomes reported will be considered by PHAC.
27	SH	Scottish Natural Heritage	2	53	It would be helpful to provide a brief description of what is meant by 'natural environment' – see General comment above and reference to Intermediate outcomes including access to and use of 'blue space (sea, lakes, rivers, canals)' in Line 150. In Line 53, this could include: urban parks and local greenspace, and path networks providing connectivity between open spaces and access to woods and forests, areas of coast and countryside	Thank you for this comment. A definition of the natural environment has been added to the revised scope and reflected in the proposed outcomes.
28	SH	Scottish Natural Heritage	3	66	Suggest that this line is revised to: ...activity that involve changes to or management of the built or natural environment.	Noted, thank you. We have amended this in the revised scope
29	SH	Scottish Natural Heritage	3	82	Suggest that this line is revised to: ...managed, maintained and welcoming to everyone.	Noted, thank you. We have amended this in the revised scope
30	SH	UK Health Forum	2	51-53	UK Health Forum suggests clarification of what is included in the guideline scope. For example, further explanation of inclusion of parks, other green spaces, blue spaces, etc. does not appear until later in the document.	Thank you for this comment. A more detailed definition of the natural environment has been added to the revised scope.
31	SH	UK Health Forum	5	135-143	UK Health Forum suggests making sure that "physical activity in everyday life" includes gardening, household chores, other everyday activities, etc. This may be the intention of the scope, but explicit clarification would be advised.	Noted, thank you. The scope provides some examples of the types of outcome measures that will be included but these will be detailed more extensively in the review protocol which will be published on the NICE website. As the focus of this guideline is on interventions in the built and natural environment which encourage people to be active, housework will be excluded but everyday activities such as active transport and active play will be included.

Comments received in the course of consultations carried out by NICE are published in the interests of openness and transparency, and to promote understanding of how recommendations are developed. The comments are published as a record of the submissions that NICE has received, and are not endorsed by NICE, its officers or advisory committees.