Healthcare Improvement Scotland

NICE Health Technology Appraisal On Implantable Cardioverter Defibrillators (ICDs) and cardiac resynchronization therapy for arrhythmias and heart failure (review of TA95 and TA120)	
TO: NICE	**FROM: Healthcare Improvement Scotland** **10 February 2014**

1. Do you consider that all the relevant evidence has been taken into account? *If not, what evidence do you consider has been omitted, and what are the implications of this omission on the results?*

Data included is up to date and fairly comprehensive. No guidance is offered for patients with heart failure and atrial fibrillation and I think that it should be emphasised that patients with atrial fibrillation may be less likely to benefit from CRT, particularly if their heart rate is not well controlled.

2. Do you consider that the analysis of clinical and cost effectiveness has used an appropriate comparator which reflects Scottish practice? *If not, please explain.*

Yes

3. Do you consider that the summaries of clinical and cost effectiveness are reasonable interpretations of the evidence? *If not, in which areas do you consider that the summaries are not reasonable interpretations*?

Yes although the cost of an admission to hospital with heart failure, in my opinion, seems to be an underestimate thereby increasing the ICER of device therapy

4. Are the provisional recommendations of the Appraisal Committee sound and do they constitute a suitable basis for the preparation of guidance to the NHS? *If not, why do you consider that the recommendations are not sound?*

Yes

5. Are the patient pathways and treatment options described in the assessment applicable to NHSScotland? *If not, how do they differ in Scotland?*

I think that they are directly applicable in Scotland

6. Would the provisional recommendations change the patient pathways and/or patient numbers in NHSScotland? *If so, please describe what these changes would be.*

Patient numbers treated with CRTP and CRTD will increase due to the expanded implantation criteria. Further financial and human resource in implanting and follow-up centres will be required to deal with this increased activity. In particular, all follow-up centres should have dedicated arrhythmia nurses to help counsel patients before and after device implantation where needed

7. Do you think there is any reason why this provisional guidance would not be as valid in Scotland as it is in England and Wales? *If yes, please explain why this is the case.*

No

8. Please add any other information which you think would be useful to NICE or helpful in guiding the Scottish response to this assessment

I welcome the updated NICE guidance on device therapy. CRT in particular has made an enormous difference to my patients and it can completely transform their lives and without doubt prevents recurrent admissions to hospital. The costs are decreasing rapidly year on year and the net cost of these devices has fallen dramatically as demonstrated by this document.

Comments provided to Healthcare Improvement Scotland by [redacted]
Consultant Cardiologist and Electrophysiologist, Royal Infirmary of Edinburgh