

██████████  
National Kidney Foundation  
The Point, Coach Road,  
Shireoaks, Worksop,  
Nottinghamshire, S81 8BW

**By email to:** ██████████

18 February 2016

Dear ██████████

**Final Appraisal Determination: immunosuppressive therapy for kidney transplantation in adults**

I am now able to let you have my final scrutiny decision in your appeal against the above Final Appraisal Determination (FAD). As I have received no further comments from you following my letter of 27 January 2016 I confirm, in accordance with that letter, that your appeal will be taken as against recommendation 1.4 of the FAD and on Ground (2) – that the recommendation is unreasonable in the light of the evidence submitted to NICE.

As I noted in my earlier letter, your two points that I consider valid are that:

- no reasonable committee which was aware of the expert evidence submitted to it could have reached the conclusion contained in recommendation 1.4. (noting that at the appeal hearing, you will need to be specific about what evidence it is that was before the committee and why this makes it unreasonable to have concluded as they did); and
- your analysis of the data suggests that the committee could reasonably only have concluded that no recommendation should be made in respect of those medicines listed at recommendation 1.4.

I do not consider the other points raised in your letter to be valid appeal points.

There will be an oral hearing, details of which have been separately notified to you.

Yours sincerely

Andy McKeon

Vice Chair

National Institute for Health and Care Excellence